# **Supplementary Figures**



**Figure S1** Joint density of the frequency *M* of the most frequent allele and statistics  $F_{ST}$ ,  $G'_{ST}$ , and *D*, for different scaled migration rates 4Nm, considering K = 40 subpopulations. The simulation procedure and figure design follow Figure 3.



**Figure S2** The means  $A_F$ ,  $A_G$ ,  $A_D$ ,  $A_{G'_N}$ , and  $A_{G''}$  of the maximal values of  $F_{ST}$ ,  $G'_{ST}$ , D,  $G'_{ST,\text{Nei}}$ , and  $G''_{ST}$  respectively, over the interval  $M \in [\frac{1}{2}, 1)$ , as functions of the number of subpopulations K.  $A_F(K)$ ,  $A_G(K)$ , and  $A_D(K)$  are copied from Figure 2.  $A_{G'_N}$  and  $A_{G''}$  are computed numerically from eqs. S4.24 and S4.27. The x-axis is plotted on a logarithmic scale. The figure design follows Figure 2.



**Figure S3** Joint density of the frequency *M* of the most frequent allele and statistics  $G'_{ST,Nei}$  and  $G''_{ST}$ , for different scaled migration rates 4Nm, considering K = 2 subpopulations. The black solid line represents the maximum value of  $G'_{ST,Nei}$  and  $G''_{ST}$  in terms of *M* (eqs. S4.24 and S4.27); the red dashed line represents the mean  $G'_{ST,Nei}$ , and  $G''_{ST}$  in sliding windows of *M* of size 0.02 (plotted from 0.51 to 0.99). Colors represent the density of loci, estimated using a Gaussian kernel density estimate with a bandwidth of 0.007, with density set to 0 outside the minimum and maximum values. Loci are simulated using coalescent software MS, assuming an island model of migration and conditioning on 1 segregating site. Each panel considers 100,000 replicate simulations, with 100 lineages sampled per subpopulation. The figure design follows Figure 3.



**Figure S4** Joint density of the frequency *M* of the most frequent allele and statistics  $G'_{ST,Nei}$  and  $G''_{ST}$ , for different scaled migration rates 4Nm, considering K = 7 subpopulations. The simulation procedure follows Figure S3. The figure design follows Figures 4 and S3.



**Figure S5** Joint density of the frequency *M* of the most frequent allele and statistics  $G'_{ST,Nei}$  and  $G''_{ST}$ , for different scaled migration rates 4Nm, considering K = 40 subpopulations. The simulation procedure follows Figure S3. The figure design follows Figures S1 and S3.

# Supplementary File S1. PROPERTIES OF THE MAXIMAL VALUES OF $G'_{ST}$ AND D AS FUNCTIONS OF

М

In this file, we derive the conditions under which the peaks (local maxima) of the maximal values of  $G'_{ST}$  (eq. 10) and D (eq. 11) in terms of M are reached, we derive their values, and we show the non-differentiability of the maximal  $G'_{ST}$  and D at the peaks.

## **1.** Position and value of the peaks in the maximum value of $G'_{ST}$ as a function of M

From eq. 2,  $G'_{ST} = 1$  if and only if

$$\frac{(H_T - H_S)(K - 1 + H_S)}{H_T(K - 1)(1 - H_S)} = 1.$$

Solving for  $H_S$ ,  $G'_{ST} = 1$  if and only if  $H_S = 0$  or  $1 - H_S = K(1 - H_T)$ .  $H_S = 0$  leads to S = M, or  $\frac{1}{K} \sum_{k=1}^{K} p_k^2 = \frac{1}{K} \sum_{k=1}^{K} p_k$ . This equation is in turn equivalent to  $\sum_{k=1}^{K} p_k(1 - p_k) = 0$ . Thus,  $H_S = 0$  if and only if each  $p_k$  is equal either to 0 or to 1.

Because for all  $\frac{1}{2} \leq M < 1$ ,  $0 < H_T \leq \frac{1}{2}$ , and it follows that  $\frac{K}{2} \leq K(1 - H_T) < K$ . In addition, because  $H_S \geq 0$ ,  $1 - H_S \leq 1$ . Thus,  $1 - H_S = K(1 - H_T)$  requires that K = 2,  $H_T = \frac{1}{2}$ , and  $H_S = 0$ , which is equivalent to having  $p_1 = 1$  and  $p_2 = 0$ , or  $p_1 = 0$  and  $p_2 = 1$ . We conclude  $G'_{ST} = 1$  if and only if all  $p_k$  are either equal to 0 or equal to 1. This condition is the same as the condition for  $F_{ST} = 1$  derived by Alcala & Rosenberg (2017, p. 1583), and thus leads to local maxima in the maximal value of  $G'_{ST}$  as a function of M at the same positions as the peaks in the maximum of  $F_{ST}$ : at  $M = \frac{i}{K}$ , with  $i = \lceil \frac{K}{2} \rceil, \lceil \frac{K}{2} \rceil + 1, \ldots, K - 1$ .

Because the maximum value of  $G'_{ST}$  as a function of M (eq. 10) is continuous, and because it is bounded above by 1 and is equal to 1 only at the peaks, it follows that the maximum value of  $G'_{ST}$  is strictly below 1 between the peaks.

#### **2.** Position of the peaks in the maximum value of *D* as a function of *M*

From eq. 3, D = 1 if and only if

$$\frac{K(H_T - H_S)}{(K - 1)(1 - H_S)} = 1.$$

Solving for  $H_S$ , D = 1 if and only if  $1 - H_S = K(1 - H_T)$ . As shown in Supplementary File S1.1, this condition is met if and only if K = 2 and  $M = \frac{1}{2}$ , with  $p_1 = 1$  and  $p_2 = 0$ , or  $p_1 = 0$  and  $p_2 = 1$ . Thus, D values are only unconstrained in the unit interval in one specific case.

For  $i = \lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor$ ,  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor + 1, ..., K - 1$ , we define the interval  $I_i$  by  $\lfloor \frac{1}{2}, \frac{i+1}{K}$ ) for  $i = \lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor$  in the case that K is odd, and by  $\lfloor \frac{i}{K}, \frac{i+1}{K}$ ) for all other (i, K). For M in  $I_i$ ,  $\lfloor KM \rfloor = i$  is constant. We denote  $x = \{KM\} = KM - i$ , so that  $M = \frac{i+x}{K}$ . Denote by  $Q_i^D(x)$  the function of x that gives the maximum value of D on interval  $I_i$  for M,

$$Q_i^D(x) = \frac{2K(i+x^2) - 2(i+x)^2}{(K-1)[K-2x(1-x)]},$$
(S1.1)

where *x* ranges in [0, 1) (or  $\lfloor \frac{1}{2}, 1$ ) in the case of odd *K* and  $i = \lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor$ ) and integers *K* and *i* satisfy  $K \ge 2$  and  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \le i \le K - 1$ .

 $D^*(M)$  is continuous at each  $M = \frac{i}{K}$ , with  $\lim_{x\to 1} Q_i^D(x) = Q_{i+1}^D(0)$  for each i with  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \leq i \leq K-2$ . The derivative of  $Q_i^D(x)$  is

$$\frac{dQ_i^D(x)}{dx} = 4 \frac{(2i - K + 1)x^2 + [(K - i - 1)^2 + (i - 1)^2 + (K - 2)]x - i^2}{(K - 1)[K - 2x(1 - x)]^2}.$$
(S1.2)

For  $x \ge 0$ ,  $\lim_{x\to 0^+} dQ_i^D(x)/dx = -4i^2/[K^2(K-1)]$ , a strictly negative quantity for all  $K \ge 2$  and  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \le i \le K-1$ . In addition,  $\lim_{x\to 1^-} dQ_i^D(x)/dx = 4(K-i-1)^2/[K^2(K-1)]$ , a strictly positive quantity for all  $K \ge 2$  and  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \le i \le K-2$ . Hence, changing variables back from x to M, we see that for each point  $M = \frac{i}{K}$  where  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \le i \le K-1$ , the continuous

function  $D^*(M)$  has a positive derivative when approaching from the left and a negative derivative when approaching from the right. Thus,  $D^*(M)$  has a local maximum at each  $\frac{i}{K}$ .

#### 3. No other peaks in the maximum value of D as a function of M

We show that for each  $K \ge 2$ , the only peaks in  $D^*(M)$  occur at  $M = \frac{i}{K}$  for  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \le i \le K - 1$ .

For each *i*, we have shown that  $\lim_{x\to 0^+} dQ_i^D(x)/dx < 0$  and  $\lim_{x\to 1^-} dQ_i^D(x)/dx \ge 0$ , with equality in the latter equation if and only if i = K - 1. As a smooth function on [0, 1] with the property that its derivative changes from negative to nonnegative on [0, 1],  $Q_i^D(x)$  has at least one critical point on [0, 1] that represents a local minimum. We show that  $Q_i^D(x)$  has no more than one critical point in [0, 1]; because it has a local minimum, it can have no local maxima interior to the interval [0, 1], so that  $D^*(M)$  can only have local maxima at points  $M = \frac{i}{K}$ .

The denominator of  $dQ_i^D(x)/dx$  is positive in [0, 1]. We find the roots of the numerator of  $dQ_i^D(x)/dx$  to obtain the critical points of  $Q_i^D(x)$ . Excluding the case of odd *K* and  $i = \lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor$ , we have

$$x = \frac{-[(K-i-1)^2 + (i-1)^2 + K-2] \pm \sqrt{[(K-i-1)^2 + (i-1)^2 + K-2]^2 + 4i^2(2i-K+1)}}{2(2i-K+1)}.$$
 (S1.3)

The negative root is negative for  $K \ge 2$ , leaving only a single critical point in the interval [0, 1].

For the case of odd *K* and  $i = \lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor$ , the numerator of  $dQ_i^D(x)/dx$  is linear in *x*, with root  $x = \frac{1}{2}$ . Hence, noting that for odd *K* and  $i = \lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor$ ,  $Q_i^G(x)$  approaches its local maximum on  $\lfloor \frac{1}{2}, 1 \rfloor$  as  $x \to 1$ , on the interval  $\lfloor \frac{1}{2}, \frac{K+1}{2K} \rfloor$ , a local minimum occurs at  $M = \frac{1}{2}$ .

#### 4. Value of the peaks in the maximum value of *D* as a function of *M*

For  $M = \frac{i}{K}$ , with integers  $K \ge 2$  and  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \le i \le K - 1$ , the maximal *D* from eq. 11 becomes

$$D^*(M) = \frac{2KM(1-M)}{K-1} = \frac{KH_T}{K-1}.$$
(S1.4)

The function 2KM(1 - M)/(K - 1) serves as an upper bound for D at all values of M, as  $D \leq \frac{KH_T}{K-1}$  for all  $H_S \geq 0$ , with equality if and only if  $H_S = 0$ ,  $D^*(M)$  touches the curve 2KM(1 - M)/(K - 1) only at values M for which  $H_S$  can equal 0, or  $M = \frac{i}{K}$  for  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor \leq i \leq K - 1$ .

# **5.** Non-differentiability of the maximal values of $G'_{ST}$ and D at the peaks

Because  $\lfloor KM \rfloor$  and  $\{KM\}$  are non-differentiable for  $M = \frac{i}{K}$  with  $i = \lceil \frac{K}{2} \rceil, \lceil \frac{K}{2} \rceil + 1, \ldots, K - 1$ , the numerators and denominators of the maximum values of  $G'_{ST}$  and D (eqs. 10 and 11) are also non-differentiable at these points, and thus, the maximal values of  $G'_{ST}$  and D are also non-differentiable at these points.

#### **6.** Limit of the maximal value of $G'_{ST}$

From eq. 10, for fixed *M* in  $\lfloor \frac{1}{2}, 1 \rfloor$ , because  $0 \leq \{KM\} < 1$  and  $\lfloor KM \rfloor / (KM) \rightarrow 1$  when  $K \rightarrow \infty$ ,

$$\lim_{K \to \infty} \frac{[K(K-1) + 2\{KM\}(1 - \{KM\})](\lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2 - KM^2)}{K(K-1)[K - 2\{KM\}(1 - \{KM\})]M(1 - M)} = 1$$

#### 7. Limit of the maximal value of *D*

Similarly, applying eqs. 5 and 11, for fixed *M* in  $[\frac{1}{2}, 1)$ , because  $0 \leq \{KM\} < 1$  and and  $\lfloor KM \rfloor / (KM) \rightarrow 1$  when  $K \rightarrow \infty$ ,

$$\lim_{K \to \infty} \frac{2K \left( \lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2 - KM^2 \right)}{(K-1) \left( K - 2\{KM\} (1 - \{KM\}) \right)} = 2M \left( 1 - M \right) = H_T$$

# Supplementary File S2. THE SIZE OF THE PERMISSIBLE RANGE FOR $G'_{ST}$ AND D

This file provides the computation of the integrals  $A_G(K)$  (eq. 13) and  $A_D(K)$  (eq. 14).

#### **1.** Computing $A_G(K)$ (eq. 13)

 $A_G(K)$  is the integral of the maximum value of  $G'_{ST}$  in terms of M (eq. 10), divided by the size range of possible M values,  $\frac{1}{2}$ :

$$A_G(K) = 2 \int_{\frac{1}{2}}^{1} \left[ \frac{[K(K-1) + 2\{KM\}(1 - \{KM\})](\lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2 - KM^2)}{K(K-1)[K - 2\{KM\}(1 - \{KM\})]M(1 - M)} \right] dM.$$
(S2.1)

For each interval  $I_i$ , the maximum value of  $G'_{ST}$  is a smooth function

$$Q_i^G(x) = \frac{\left[K(K-1) + 2x(1-x)\right] \left[K(i+x^2) - (i+x)^2\right]}{(K-1) \left[K - 2x(1-x)\right] (i+x)(K-i-x)},$$
(S2.2)

where *x* lies in [0, 1), *i* is an integer that lies in  $\lfloor \lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor$ ,  $\lfloor \frac{K}{2} \rfloor + 1, ..., K - 1 \rfloor$ , and *K* is an integer greater than or equal to 2. Using the fact that x = KM - i, we obtain dx = KdM. We can break integral  $A_G(K)$  into a sum of integrals of  $Q_i^G(x)$  over intervals  $I_i$ ,

$$A_{G}(K) = \begin{cases} \frac{2}{K} \sum_{i=\frac{K}{2}}^{K-1} \int_{0}^{1} Q_{i}^{G}(x) dx \text{ for even } K, \\ \frac{2}{K} \left[ \int_{\frac{1}{2}}^{1} Q_{\frac{K-1}{2}}^{G}(x) dx + \sum_{i=\frac{K+1}{2}}^{K-1} \int_{0}^{1} Q_{i}^{G}(x) dx \right] \text{ for odd } K. \end{cases}$$
(S2.3)

Because  $Q_i^G(x)$  is a rational function, we use partial fraction decomposition to compute its integral.  $Q_i^G(x)$  can be written

$$Q_i^G(x) = 1 - \frac{Kh_2(K,i)}{2(x+i)} - \frac{Kh_2(K,K-i-1)}{2(K-x-i)} - \frac{K\sqrt{2K-1}h_1(K,i)}{(2x-1)^2 + (2K-1)} - \frac{2K(2x-1)h_0(K,i)}{(2x-1)^2 + (2K-1)}.$$
(S2.4)

In this expression,  $h_1(K, i)$ ,  $h_2(K, i)$ , and  $h_3(K, i)$  are functions that are independent of *x*:

$$h_0(K,i) = \frac{K^3(2i-K+1)}{(K-1)[i^2+(i+1)^2+(K-1)][(K-i-1)^2+(K-i)^2+(K-1)]}$$
(S2.5)

$$h_1(K,i) = \frac{4Ki(K-i-1)[(K-i)^2 + (i+1)^2 - 1]}{(K-1)[i^2 + (i+1)^2 + (K-1)][(K-i-1)^2 + (K-i)^2 + (K-1)]\sqrt{2K-1}}$$
(S2.6)

$$h_2(K,i) = \frac{2i(i+1)}{K(K-1)} \left[ 1 - \frac{K^2}{i^2 + (i+1)^2 + (K-1)} \right].$$
(S2.7)

Letting y = 2x - 1, we integrate by noting  $\int \frac{y}{y^2 + c} dy = \frac{1}{2} \log(y^2 + c)$  and  $\int \frac{1}{y^2 + c} dy = \frac{1}{\sqrt{c}} \arctan(y/\sqrt{c})$ , where *c* is a positive constant not dependent on *y*. For  $\lceil \frac{K}{2} \rceil \le i \le K - 1$ ,

$$\frac{2}{K} \int_{0}^{1} Q_{i}^{G}(x) dx = \frac{2}{K} - 2h_{1}(K, i) \arctan\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2K - 1}}\right) + h_{2}(K, i) \log\left(\frac{i}{i + 1}\right) + h_{2}(K, K - i - 1) \log\left(\frac{K - i - 1}{K - i}\right), \quad (S2.8)$$

and for  $i = \frac{K-1}{2}$ ,

$$\frac{2}{K} \int_{\frac{1}{2}}^{1} Q_{\frac{K-1}{2}}^{G}(x) \, dx = \frac{1}{K} - h_1 \left( K, \frac{K-1}{2} \right) \arctan\left( \frac{1}{\sqrt{2K-1}} \right) + h_2 \left( K, \frac{K-1}{2} \right) \log\left( \frac{K-1}{K+1} \right). \tag{S2.9}$$

SI 8 | Alcala and Rosenberg

From eq. S2.6,  $h_1(K, i) = h_1(K, K - i - 1)$ . Consequently, for even *K*, we simplify the expression for  $A_G(K)$  by noting that  $\sum_{i=K/2}^{K-1} h_1(K,i) = \sum_{i=0}^{K/2-1} h_1(K,i), \text{ and } 2\sum_{i=K/2}^{K-1} h_1(K,i) = \sum_{i=0}^{K-1} h_1(K,i). \text{ We can similarly simplify the expression for } A_G(K)$ when K is odd, because  $\sum_{i=(K+1)/2}^{K-1} h_1(K,i) = \sum_{i=0}^{(K-3)/2} h_1(K,i), \text{ and thus, } [2\sum_{i=(K+1)/2}^{K-1} h_1(K,i)] + h_1[K,\frac{K-1}{2}] = \sum_{i=0}^{K-1} h_1(K,i).$ Because  $\sum_{i=K/2}^{K-1} h_2(K, K-i-1) \log[(K-i-1)/(K-i)] = \sum_{i=0}^{K/2-1} h_2(K, i) \log[i/(i+1)]$ , we can group terms involving  $h_2$  in the expression for  $A_G(K)$  when K is even (eq. S2.3) into a single sum  $\sum_{i=0}^{K-1} h_2(K,i) \log[i/(i+1)]$ . Similarly, because  $\sum_{i=(K+1)/2}^{K-1} h_2(K, K-i-1) \log[(K-i-1)/(K-i)] = \sum_{i=0}^{(K-3)/2} h_2(K, i) \log[i/(i+1)], \text{ we can group the terms involving } h_2 \text{ in the expression for } A_G(K) \text{ when } K \text{ is odd into a sum } \sum_{i=0}^{K-1} h_2(K, i) \log[i/(i+1)].$ 

Substituting eqs. S2.8 and S2.9 into eq. S2.3, grouping the expressions with  $h_1$  and  $h_2$ , taking  $0 \log 0 = 0$ , and simplifying, the expressions for  $A_G(K)$  for even and odd K equalize and we obtain eq. 13.

## **2.** Increase of $A_G(K)$ as a function of *K*

We must show that  $\Delta_G(K) = A_G(K+1) - A_G(K) \ge 0$ . We numerically computed  $A_G(K)$  (eq. 13) and  $\Delta_G(K)$  for K ranging from 2 to 10,000; we found that  $\Delta_G(K) > 0$  for all *K* in that range.

Although this numerical result does not formally prove that  $\Delta_G(K) > 0$  for all *K*, we note that because  $1 \ge G'_{ST} \ge F_{ST}$ owing to the normalization in the definition of  $G'_{ST}$ ,  $1 \ge A_G(K) \ge A_F(K)$ . Hence, because  $\lim_{K\to\infty} A_F(K) = 1$ , we also have  $\lim_{K\to\infty} A_G(K) = 1.$ 

# **3.** Computing $A_D(K)$ (eq. 14)

 $A_D(K)$  is the integral of the maximum value of D in terms of M (eq. 11), divided by the size range of possible M values,  $\frac{1}{2}$ :

$$A_D(K) = 2 \int_{\frac{1}{2}}^{1} \frac{2K}{K-1} \frac{\lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2 - KM^2}{K-2\{KM\}(1-\{KM\})} dM.$$
(S2.10)

Using  $Q_i^D(x)$  (eq. S1.1), we break  $A_D(K)$  into a sum of integrals over domains  $I_i$ ,

$$A_D(K) = \begin{cases} \frac{2}{K} \sum_{i=\frac{K}{2}}^{K-1} \int_0^1 Q_i^D(x) \, dx \text{ for even } K, \\ \frac{2}{K} \left[ \int_{\frac{1}{2}}^1 Q_{\frac{K-1}{2}}^D(x) \, dx + \sum_{i=\frac{K+1}{2}}^{K-1} \int_0^1 Q_i^D(x) \, dx \right] \text{ for odd } K. \end{cases}$$
(S2.11)

We use a partial fraction decomposition of the rational function  $Q_i^D(x)$ :

$$Q_i^D(x) = 1 - \frac{2}{K-1} \left[ \frac{(2x-1)f_1(K,i)}{(2x-1)^2 + (2K-1)} + \frac{f_2(K,i)}{(2x-1)^2 + (2K-1)} \right],$$
(S2.12)

where  $f_1(K,i) = 2i - K + 1$  and  $f_2(K,i) = i^2 + (K - i - 1)^2$  are functions that do not depend on *x*.

Letting y = 2x - 1,  $Q_i^D(x)$  can be integrated by again applying  $\int \frac{y}{y^2 + c} dy = \frac{1}{2} \log(y^2 + c)$  and  $\int \frac{1}{y^2 + c} dy = \frac{1}{\sqrt{c}} \arctan(y/\sqrt{c})$ , where *c* is a positive constant that does not depend on *y*. For  $\lceil \frac{K}{2} \rceil \leq i \leq K - 1$ ,

$$\frac{2}{K} \int_{0}^{1} Q_{i}^{D}(x) \, dx = \frac{2}{K} - \frac{4[i^{2} + (K - 1 - i)^{2}]}{K(K - 1)\sqrt{2K - 1}} \arctan\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2K - 1}}\right),\tag{S2.13}$$

and for  $i = \frac{K-1}{2}$ ,

$$\frac{2}{K} \int_{\frac{1}{2}}^{1} Q_{\frac{K-1}{2}}^{D}(x) \, dx = \frac{1}{K} - \frac{(K-1)}{K\sqrt{2K-1}} \arctan\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2K-1}}\right).$$
(S2.14)

We can eliminate terms in *i* from eq. S2.11 when *K* is even by noting

$$\sum_{i=\frac{K}{2}}^{K-1} [i^2 + (K-1-i)^2] = \sum_{i=\frac{K}{2}}^{K-1} i^2 + \sum_{i=\frac{K}{2}}^{K-1} (K-1-i)^2 = \sum_{i=0}^{K-1} i^2.$$
(S2.15)

Similarly, we can eliminate terms in *i* from the expression for  $A_D(K)$  when *K* is odd:

$$\sum_{i=\frac{K+1}{2}}^{K-1} [i^2 + (K-1-i)^2] = \left(\sum_{i=0}^{K-1} i^2\right) - \left(\frac{K-1}{2}\right)^2.$$
(S2.16)

Because  $\sum_{i=0}^{K-1} i^2 = K(K-1)(2K-1)/6$ , we substitute eqs. S2.15 and S2.16 into eq. S2.11 and simplify the sums. The expressions for  $A_D(K)$  when K is even and odd equalize, and we obtain eq. 14.

#### **4.** Decrease of $A_D(K)$ as a function of *K*

To show that  $A_D(K)$  is decreasing in K, we must show that  $dA_D/dK < 0$  for all  $K \ge 2$ . From the expression for  $A_D(K)$  in eq. 14,

$$\frac{dA_D}{dK} = \frac{1}{3} \left[ \frac{1}{K} - \frac{2\arctan\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2K-1}}\right)}{\sqrt{2K-1}} \right].$$
(S2.17)

Let  $f(x) = \arctan(x) - (x - x^3/3)$ . Because f(0) = 0 and  $f'(x) = x^4/(1 + x^2) > 0$ , f(x) > 0 for positive x. Hence,

$$\arctan\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2K-1}}\right) \ge \frac{1}{\sqrt{2K-1}} - \frac{1}{3(2K-1)^{3/2}}.$$
 (S2.18)

Applying inequality S2.18 in eq. S2.17, we obtain

$$\frac{dA_D}{dK} \leqslant -\frac{4K-3}{9K(2K-1)^2},$$
(S2.19)

which is strictly negative for all  $K \ge 2$ . We conclude that  $dA_D/dK < 0$  and hence that  $A_D(K)$  decreases monotonically as a function of *K*.

For the limit of  $A_D(K)$  as  $K \to \infty$ , we use l'Hôpital's rule to find  $\lim_{K\to\infty} \arctan(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2K-1}})/(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2K-1}}) = 1$ , so that  $\lim_{K\to\infty} A_D(K) = \frac{1}{3}$ .

# Supplementary File S3. MS COMMANDS TO SIMULATE NUCLEOTIDE SEQUENCES UNDER AN EQUI-LIBRIUM ISLAND MODEL WITH K SUBPOPULATIONS AND SCALED MIGRA-TION RATE 4NM

#### K = 2

./ms 200 100000 -s 1 -I 2 100 100 0.1 ./ms 200 100000 -s 1 -I 2 100 100 1 ./ms 200 100000 -s 1 -I 2 100 100 10

## For K = 7

./ms 700 100000 -s 1 -I 7 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 0.1 ./ms 700 100000 -s 1 -I 7 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 1 ./ms 700 100000 -s 1 -I 7 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 10

#### **For** K = 40

# Supplementary File S4. PROPERTIES OF NEI'S $G'_{ST}$ AND MEIRMANS AND HEDRICK'S $G''_{ST}$

This supplementary information file provides results regarding alternative formulations of  $F_{ST}$  and  $G'_{ST}$ —Nei's  $G'_{ST}$  and Meirmans and Hedrick's  $G''_{ST}$ —that include a multiplicative term based on the number of sampled populations *K*.

#### Mathematical constraints on $G'_{ST}$ and $G''_{ST}$

Using  $H_T$ ,  $H_S$ , and  $D_{ST} = H_T - H_S$ , Nei (1987, pp. 188-191) defined a measure  $G'_{ST,Nei}$ :

$$D'_{ST} = \frac{K}{K-1}(H_T - H_S)$$
$$H'_T = H_S + D'_{ST}$$
$$G'_{ST,\text{Nei}} = \frac{D'_{ST}}{H'_T} = \frac{K(H_T - H_S)}{KH_T - H_S}$$

From eqs. 4 and 5, substituting  $H_S = 2(M - S)$  and  $H_T = 2M(1 - M)$  for the biallelic case,  $G'_{ST,Nei}$  becomes

$$G'_{ST,Nei} = \frac{K(S - M^2)}{M(K - 1 - KM) + S}.$$
(S4.20)

Meirmans & Hedrick (2011, eq. 4) defined a second quantity  $G''_{ST}$  by

$$G_{ST}'' = \frac{G_{ST,\text{Nei}}'}{G_{ST,\text{Nei,max}}'} = \frac{K(H_T - H_S)}{(KH_T - H_S)(1 - H_S)}.$$
(S4.21)

From eqs. 4 and 5, substituting  $H_S$  and  $H_T$  by their values as functions of M and S, eq. S4.21 becomes:

$$G_{ST}'' = \frac{K(S - M^2)}{[M(K - 1 - KM) + S](1 - 2M + 2S)}.$$
(S4.22)

# Maximal values of $G'_{ST}$ and $G''_{ST}$

We first show that if *M* is fixed,  $G'_{ST,\text{Nei}}$  is increasing when treated as a function of *S*. By Theorem 1 of Alcala & Rosenberg (2017), for fixed *M* and *K*, *S* is positive, satisfying  $M^2 \leq S \leq \lfloor \lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2 \rfloor / K$ . In particular, because  $\frac{1}{2} \leq M < 1$ , we have  $\frac{1}{4} \leq S \leq 1$ . The derivative of  $G'_{ST,\text{Nei}}$  with respect to *S* is

$$\frac{dG'_{ST,\text{Nei}}}{dS} = \frac{K(K-1)M(1-M)}{[M(K-1-KM)+S]^2}.$$
(S4.23)

The numerator is positive, as  $\frac{1}{2} \leq M < 1$  and  $K \geq 2$ . Noting  $H_T = 2M(1 - M)$  and  $H_S = 2(M - S)$ , the denominator equals  $\frac{1}{4}(KH_T - H_S)^2$ , a quantity that is also strictly positive, as  $H_T \geq H_S$  by the Wahlund principle,  $H_T > 0$ , and  $K \geq 2$ .  $G'_{ST,\text{Nei}}$  is therefore an increasing function of *S*, so that its maximum as a function of *M* occurs when *S* lies at its largest permissible value given *M*. For fixed *M*,  $\frac{1}{2} \leq M < 1$ , Theorem 1 of Alcala & Rosenberg (2017) gives the maximum for *S* as a function of *M*. Inserting this maximum, we have:

$$G'_{ST,\text{Nei}} \leq \frac{\lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2 - KM^2}{KM(1-M) - M + \lfloor KM \rfloor / K + \{KM\}^2 / K}.$$
(S4.24)

Similarly, we show that  $G''_{ST}$  is an increasing function of *S* for *M* in  $\lfloor \frac{1}{2}, 1$  and integers  $K \ge 2$ . For fixed *M*, the derivative of  $G''_{ST}$  with respect to *S* is

$$\frac{dG_{ST}''}{dS} = \frac{K \left[-2(S-M^2)^2 + (K-1)M(1-M)[1-2M(1-M)]\right]}{[M(K-1-KM)+S]^2(1-2M+2S)^2},$$

$$= \frac{K[(K-1)H_T(1-H_T) - (H_T-H_S)^2]}{2[M(K-1-KM)+S]^2(1-H_S)^2}.$$
(S4.25)

The denominator in eq. S4.25 is positive, as a product of the positive  $\frac{1}{4}(KH_T - H_S)^2$  and  $(1 - H_S)^2$  for  $0 \le H_S \le \frac{1}{2}$ . Hence, the sign of  $dG''_{ST}/dS$  is determined by the sign of its numerator. We find the roots of the numerator as a function of  $H_T$ , denoted  $H_{T,1}$  and  $H_{T,2}$ :

$$H_{T,1} = \frac{K - 1 + 2H_S + \sqrt{(K - 1)[K - 1 + 4H_S(1 - H_S)]}}{2K},$$
  

$$H_{T,2} = \frac{K - 1 + 2H_S - \sqrt{(K - 1)[K - 1 + 4H_S(1 - H_S)]}}{2K}.$$
(S4.26)

To show that  $G''_{ST}$  is increasing in *S* for permissible values of *S*, we examine the roots. For biallelic markers,  $0 \le H_S \le \frac{1}{2}$ , and  $H_S(1 - H_S)$  is an increasing function of  $H_S$ . It then follows that  $H_{T,1}$  is also an increasing function of  $H_S$ . Consequently, the minimum value of  $H_{T,1}$ , treated as a function of  $H_S$ , is reached at  $H_S = 0$ , yielding  $H_{T,1} \ge (K - 1)/K \ge \frac{1}{2}$  for all  $K \ge 2$ . Because for biallelic markers  $H_T \le \frac{1}{2}$ ,  $H_{T,1} \ge H_T$ . For  $H_{T,2}$ , because  $0 \le H_S \le \frac{1}{2}$ ,  $H_S(1 - H_S) \ge 0$ , and  $H_{T,2} \le [K - 1 + 2H_S - \sqrt{(K - 1)^2}]/(2K) = H_S/K < H_S$  for all  $K \ge 2$ . Because the Wahlund principle ensures that  $H_T \ge H_S$ ,  $H_{T,2} < H_T$ .

Because the numerator of  $dG''_{ST}/dS$  is a quadratic expression in  $H_T$  with a negative leading term  $-KH_T^2$ , it is positive between its roots. We have shown that the permissible values of  $H_T$  satisfy  $H_{T,2} < H_T \leq H_{T,1}$ . Hence, the numerator of  $dG''_{ST}/dS$  is non-negative for all  $0 \leq H_S \leq \frac{1}{2}$  and  $H_S \leq H_T \leq \frac{1}{2}$ , with equality requiring  $H_T = H_{T,1} = \frac{1}{2}$ , K = 2,  $H_S = 0$ , and  $M = \frac{1}{2}$ .

This argument demonstrates that for each  $M \neq \frac{1}{2}$ ,  $G''_{ST}$  is an increasing function of *S* on the permissible interval for *S*. Its maximum as a function of *M* occurs when *S* lies at its largest permissible value given *M*. Hence, for fixed  $K \ge 2$  and fixed *M*,  $\frac{1}{2} \le M < 1$ , using Theorem 1 from Alcala & Rosenberg (2017) to specify this value of *S* given *M*, we substitute the maximum of *S* into eq. S4.20:

$$G_{ST}'' \leq \frac{\lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2 - KM^2}{[KM(1-M) - M + \lfloor KM \rfloor/K + \{KM\}^2/K](1 - 2M + 2(\lfloor KM \rfloor + \{KM\}^2)/K)}.$$
(S4.27)

Note that for  $M = \frac{1}{2}$ , eq. S4.27 evaluates to 1, the largest possible value for  $G''_{ST}$ , so that eq. S4.27 is also valid for  $M = \frac{1}{2}$ .

# Comparison of the ranges of possible values of $F_{ST}$ , $G'_{ST}$ , D, $G'_{ST,Nei}$ , and $G''_{ST}$

We computed the ranges of possible values of  $G'_{ST,Nei}$  and  $G''_{ST}$ , denoted  $A_{G'_N}$  and  $A_{G''}$ , numerically, for *K* ranging from 2 to 10,000, using the same procedure as for  $G'_{ST}$ . Results appear in Figure S2.

# Simulation-based distributions of $G'_{ST,Nei}$ and $G''_{ST}$

We performed simulations using the same procedure as that used to produce Figures 3, 4, and S1. Results appear in Figures S3–S5.

# Literature Cited

Alcala N, Rosenberg NA (2017) Mathematical constraints on  $F_{ST}$ : biallelic markers in arbitrarily many populations. *Genetics*, **206**, 1581–1600.

Meirmans PG, Hedrick PW (2011) Assessing population structure:  $F_{ST}$  and related measures. *Molecular Ecology Resources*, **11**, 5–18.

Nei M (1987) Molecular evolutionary genetics. Columbia university press.